XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General of California THOMAS L. RINALDI					
Supervising Deputy Attorney General VIVIAN CHO					
Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 293773					
Los Angeles, CA 90013					
Facsimile: (213) 897-2804					
Attorneys for Complainant					
BEFORE THE					
DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR					
STATE OF C.	ALIFORNIA				
In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/19-3590				
MARIA I. SANCHEZ dba HERMANOS	ACCUSATION				
TEST ONLY 27437 5th St #2					
Highland, CA 92346					
Automotive Repair Dealer Registration					
Smog Check, Test Only, Station License No. TC 267653,					
OCTAVIO GONZALEZ					
Rialto, CA 92376					
Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621					
and					
25016 Vine St					
-					
- Respondents.					
	Attorney General of California THOMAS L. RINALDI Supervising Deputy Attorney General VIVIAN CHO Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 293773 300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6603 Facsimile: (213) 897-2804 Attorneys for Complainant  BEFOR DEPARTMENT OF CO FOR THE BUREAU OF A STATE OF C.  In the Matter of the Accusation Against:  MARIA I. SANCHEZ dba HERMANOS TEST ONLY 27437 5th St #2 Highland, CA 92346  Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 267653 Smog Check, Test Only, Station License No. TC 267653, OCTAVIO GONZALEZ 627 South Olive Ave Unit A Rialto, CA 92376  Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621 and ELEAZAR BRYAN LOPEZ				

### 

## 

## 

#### **PARTIES**

1. Patrick Dorais ("Complainant") brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair, Department of Consumer Affairs.

#### Maria I. Sanchez

- 2. On or about January 6, 2012, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 267653 to Maria I. Sanchez ("Respondent Sanchez") doing business as Hermanos Test Only. The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on January 31, 2020, unless renewed.
- 3. On or about January 6, 2012, the Bureau issued Smog Check, Test Only, Station License No. TC 267653 to Respondent Sanchez doing business as Hermanos Test Only. The Smog Check, Test Only, Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on January 31, 2020, unless renewed.
- 4. On or about October 26, 2011, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 266963 to ("Respondent Sanchez") doing business as One Stop Test Only. The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on October 31, 2020, unless renewed.
- 5. On or about November 9, 2011, the Bureau issued Smog Check, Test Only, Station License No. TC 266963 to ("Respondent Sanchez") doing business as One Stop Test Only. The Smog Check, Test Only, Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on October 31, 2020, unless renewed.

#### Octavio Gonzales

6. On or about June 13, 2013, the Bureau issued Smog Check Inspector No. EO 635621 to Octavio Gonzalez ("Respondent Gonzalez"). The Smog Check Inspector was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on January 31, 2021, unless renewed.

///

#### Eleazar Bryan Lopez

7. On or about July 27, 2011, the Bureau issued Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License Number EA 633439 to Eleazar Bryan Lopez ("Respondent Lopez"). On February 19, 2013, Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License Number EA 633439 was renewed pursuant to Respondent Lopez's election under California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.28, subdivision (e), as Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 633439 and Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 633439. The Smog Check Inspector License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on February 28, 2021, unless renewed.

#### **JURISDICTION**

- 8. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs ("Director") for the Bureau of Automotive Repair, under the authority of the following laws.
- 9. Business and Professions Code section 118, subdivision (b) provides that suspension, expiration, surrender, or cancellation of a license shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary action during the period within which the license may be renewed, restored, reissued or reinstated.
- 10. Business and Professions Code section 9884.13 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the Director or chief of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision invalidating a registration temporarily or permanently.
- 11. Section 44002 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Director has all the powers and authority granted under the Automotive Repair Act for enforcing the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.
- 12. Section 44072.6 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration or suspension of a license by operation of law, or by order or decision of the Director

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Respondent Lopez's Smog Check Repair Technician License expired on February 28, 2015 and has not been renewed.

25.

During the ASM inspection, a vehicle undergoes a loaded mode test on a dynamometer. The vehicle's drive wheels are placed on rollers and the vehicle is driven at speeds of 15 and 25 miles per hour to simulate driving conditions while the emissions are sampled by the EIS. Mode 1 begins when the vehicle speed stabilizes at 15 miles per hour, and Mode 2 begins when the vehicle speed stabilizes at 25 miles per hour.

- b. Pre-2000 model year vehicles registered in Basic Areas and vehicles that are incompatible with the ASM inspection must undergo a Two Speed Idle (TSI) inspection. Rather than applying a load to the vehicle's drive wheels with a dynamometer, the EIS measures the emissions of hydrocarbons, carbon monoxide, carbon dioxide, and oxygen at two test sequences—2500 revolutions per minute and idle.
- 29. During the visual inspection, the technician must inspect emission control components to verify that they are present and properly connected.
- 30. The functional test, depending on the vehicle, may include checking the ignition timing, malfunction indicator light, and Exhaust Gas Recirculation system, as well as conducting a low-pressure test of the evaporative emissions controls, a visible smoke test, and a pressure test of the fuel cap. An On-Board Diagnostics (OBDII) functional test is also performed on most 1996 to 1999 model year vehicles. The OBDII system monitors the vehicle's emission control system performance and includes self-diagnostic and reporting functions. During an OBDII functional test, the technician connects a test cable from EIS to the vehicle's Diagnostic Link Connector. Through the Diagnostic Link Connector, the EIS retrieves information from the vehicle's on-board computer about its ability to communicate, the status of the readiness monitors and the malfunction indicator light command, as well as diagnostic trouble codes. The readiness monitors indicate whether the OBDII system has run a sufficient number of self-tests on the vehicle's emission and engine control systems. A failure of one or more of the OBDII functional criteria, depending on model year of the vehicle, will result in the vehicle failing its smog check inspection. In addition to reporting the outcome of the OBDII functional test, the smog check inspection results also show diagnostic trouble codes if there are any in the vehicle's on-board computer memory.

///

26

27

26

27

28

31. The technician must enter the results of the visual and functional inspections into the EIS. The EIS determines whether the vehicle passed the inspection based on the results of the tailpipe, visual, and functional tests. A vehicle must pass all three parts to pass the overall inspection and receive a Certificate of Compliance. The EIS generates a Vehicle Inspection Report (VIR), which includes the test results and the Certificate of Compliance number issued to a passing vehicle. An electronic copy of the VIR is transmitted to the Vehicle Information Database (VID).<sup>3</sup> A physical copy is printed, which the technician must sign under penalty of perjury, indicating that the inspection was performed in accordance with Bureau guidelines.

#### **CLEAN GASSING**

- 32. On or around June 13, 2019, Bureau Representative Ian Evans and Air Quality Engineer Francis Di Genova conducted a detailed review of second-by-second<sup>4</sup> data for smog check inspections performed at Hermanos Test Only and found that they revealed a pattern of readings consistent with clean gassing. Bureau Representative Evans and Air Quality Engineer Di Genova identified the allowable emission levels or "cutpoints" for Mode 1 and Mode 2 of the ASM inspection of a particular vehicle. The cutpoints were then compared to second-by-second data obtained from Hermanos Test Only. Based on discrepancies in the second-by-second test data, Bureau Representative Evans and Bureau Air Quality Engineer Di Genova determined that twelve (12) pre-2000 model year vehicles<sup>5</sup> received fraudulent Smog Check Certificates of Compliance by way of clean gassing, as set forth in detail in paragraph 32 below.
- "Clean gassing" is a method by which surrogate gases are introduced into a Smog 33. Check analyzer, or Emission Inspection System (EIS), in order to dilute the exhaust of pollution-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The VID contains data from the DMV, emission standards, smog check inspections, smog check stations and technicians, and Certificates of Compliance. The VID receives passing smog check results immediately following the inspection. During the vehicle registration process, the DMV accesses the VID to verify that the vehicle has been tested and certified. The Bureau can also access the VID to view test data on smog check inspections performed at any smog check station, or search for, retrieve, and print a test record for a particular vehicle that has been tested.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Second-by-second data refers to vehicle emissions and speed data recorded on a second-bysecond basis throughout the smog check ASM tests.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The Bureau's initial investigation consisted of 14 vehicles. For the purposes of Complainant's Accusation, vehicle 6 (1992 Honda Accord) and vehicle 14 (1998 Chevrolet Tahoe) have been omitted.

causing emissions. This alters the vehicle exhaust samples and causes the EIS to issue a passing test result based on a fraudulent reading of exhaust emissions rather than the actual vehicle emissions. Unlike clean piping or clean plugging, where another car is substituted for the failing car, another car is not involved in clean gassing.

34. Further review of test data revealed that all 12 vehicles were tested on two separate dates at Hermanos Test Only. The tailpipe portion of the inspections for all 12 vehicles were performed using the BAR 97-ASM test at two loaded mode sequences of 15 and 25 miles per hour. All 12 vehicles failed the first inspection for failing at least the tailpipe portion of the inspection. Most vehicles underwent their second inspection at Hermanos Test Only within days after their failing first inspection. All 12 vehicles passed the tailpipe portion of their second inspections and were issued fraudulent electronic Smog Check Certificates of Compliance. Eleven of the 12 inspections, performed by way of clean gassing, were conducted by Respondent Gonzales. One of the 12 inspections, performed by way of clean gassing, was conducted by Respondent Lopez. Respondents' clean gassing activities as to these 12 vehicles that occurred between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019 are illustrated below in Table 1 below and set forth in further detail below:

TABLE 1					
No. 6	First Test Date (Failed)	Second Test Date (Passed)	Vehicle (Year, Make, Model) License No. & VIN No.	Certificate No.	
1	3/12/2016	3/21/2016	1997 Toyota Camry CA License No. 3VAC693 VIN No. 4T1BG22K0VU093905	YZ588086C	
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)			
2	9/16/2017	11/15/2017	1994 Acura Integra CA License No. 7MCC625 VIN No. JH4DC4452RS048749	НН624835С	
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)			
3	12/23/2017	12/28/2017	1998 Honda Accord CA License No. 7PYV864 VIN No. 1HGCG2250WA004163	НЈ513291С	
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)			
4	2/15/2018	2/24/2018	1993 Ford F150 Super Cab Short CA License No. 8D66279 VIN No. 1FTEX15N3PKB55295	HN897821C	
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)			

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> To maintain consistency between the numbering of vehicles in this Accusation with those set forth in the Bureau's investigation, vehicles numbered 6 and 14 are omitted from Table 1.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

No.	First Test Date (Failed)	Second Test Date (Passed)	Vehicle (Year, Make, Model) License No. & VIN No.	Certificate No.
5	1/27/2018	3/10/2018	1994 Nissan Pickup 2WD CA License No. 05393U1 VIN No. 1N6SD11S9RC366647	
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)		HN897838C
7	7/26/2018	7/31/2018	1996 Toyota 4Runner CA License No. 7URH904 VIN No. JT3GN86R8T0014807	
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)		HV187727C
8	7/28/2018	8/3/2018	1981 Chevrolet C10 Pickup CA License No. None VIN No. 1GCEC14H8BS101913	HV187733C
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)		
9	8/16/2018	8/22/2018	1990 Honda Civic CA License No. 8APJ022 VIN No. 1HGED4663LA008347	QM506960C
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)		
10	9/13/2018	9/20/2018	1998 Honda Civic CA License No. 4CXW546 VIN No. 1HGEJ8143WL128888	QO644803C
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)		
11	5/15/2018	11/20/2018	1993 Chevrolet C1500 Pickup	HV894732C
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	CA License No. 4N49301 VIN No. 2GCEC19K0P1107829	
12	12/10/2018	12/12/2018	1999 Nissan Altima CA License No. 4TFH568 VIN No. 1N4DL01D2XC143671	
	Gonzalez (EO 635621)	Gonzalez (EO 635621)		HZ016765C
13	4/2/2019	4/4/2019	1990 Toyota Cab/Chassis CA License No. 8G57437 VIN No. JT5VN94T4L0015780 ID82808	
	Lopez (EO 633439)	Lopez (EO 633439)		ID828087C

#### a. Vehicle 1: 1997 Toyota Camry

On March 21, 2016 at 11:36:37 a.m., a 1997 Toyota Camry (CA License #3VAC693; VIN 4T1BG22K0VU093905) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. YZ588086C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of hydrocarbons (HC), carbon monoxide (CO), and/or nitrogen oxides (NO $_{\rm x}$ ):

• At 59 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.

- At 70 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 94 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only just nine days prior on March 12, 2016 at 11:58:26 a.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of HC and CO exceeded the cutpoints during one or both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### b. Vehicle 2: 1994 Acura Integra

On November 15, 2017 at 3:18:22 p.m., a 1994 Acura Integra (CA License # 7MCC625; VIN JH4DC4452RS048749) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. HH624835C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 45 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 61 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 87 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only about two months prior on September 16, 2017 at 12:50:45 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### c. Vehicle 3: 1998 Honda Accord

On December 28, 2017 at 5:27:59 p.m., a 1998 Honda Accord (CA License # 7PYV864; VIN 1HGCG2250WA004163) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check

Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. HJ513291C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 38 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 56 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 84 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only just five days prior on December 23, 2017 at 1:17:42 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### d. Vehicle 4: 1993 Ford F150 Super Cab Short

On February 24, 2018 at 9:32:49 a.m., a 1993 Ford F150 Super Cab Short (CA License #8D66279; VIN 1FTEX15N3PKB55295) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. HN897821C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 36 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 50 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 60 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.
- At 79 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 109 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only just nine days prior on February 15, 2018 at 4:15:58 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### e. Vehicle 5: 1994 Nissan Pickup 2WD

On March 10, 2018 at 10:20:16 a.m., a 1994 Nissan Pickup 2WD (CA License #05393U1; VIN 1N6SD11S9RC366647) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. HN897838C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 29 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 48 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 75 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only six weeks prior on January 27, 2018 at 12:53:28 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### f. Vehicle 7: 1996 Toyota 4Runner

On July 31, 2018 at 2:26:47 p.m., a 1996 Toyota 4Runner (CA License #7URH904; VIN JT3GN86R8T0014807) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. HV187727C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 55 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 72 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 99 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only just five days prior on July 26, 2018 at 2:33:53 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of HC and NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during one or both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### g. Vehicle 8: 1981 Chevrolet C10 Pickup

On August 3, 2018 at 1:47:29 p.m., a 1981 Chevrolet C10 Pickup (CA License None; VIN 1GCEC14H8BS101913) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. HV187733C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 30 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 47 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 65 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only just six days prior on July 28, 2018 at 12:26:48 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of HC and CO exceeded the cutpoints during both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### h. Vehicle 9: 1990 Honda Civic

On August 22, 2018 at 1:23:33 p.m., a 1990 Honda Civic (CA License #8APJ022; VIN 1HGED4663LA008347) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector

License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. QM506960C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 37 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 54 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 86 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only just six days prior on August 16, 2018 at 1:43:32 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### i. Vehicle 10: 1998 Honda Civic

On September 20, 2018 at 11:25:52 a.m., a 1998 Honda Civic (CA License #4CXW546; VIN 1HGEJ8143WL128888) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. QO644803C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 36 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 53 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 68 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.
- At 93 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 118 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

28 | ///

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only just seven days prior on September 13, 2018 at 2:34:34 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of HC and NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during one or both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### j. Vehicle 11: 1993 Chevrolet C1500 Pickup

On November 20, 2018 at 3:15:20 p.m., a 1993 Chevrolet C1500 Pickup (CA License #4N49301; VIN 2GCEC19K0P1107829) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. HV894732C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 27 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 44 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 66 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only about six months prior on May 15, 2018 at 1:05:47 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### k. Vehicle 12: 1999 Nissan Altima

On December 12, 2018 at 2:55:24 p.m., a 1999 Nissan Altima (CA License #4TFH568; VIN 1N4DL01D2XC143671) was inspected under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. HZ016765C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 46 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 63 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 84 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only just two days prior on December 10, 2018 at 4:44:07 p.m. under Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635621. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of HC and NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

#### 1. Vehicle 13: 1990 Toyota Cab/Chassis

On April 4, 2019 at 12:49:25 p.m., a 1990 Toyota Cab/Chassis (CA License #8G57437; VIN JT5VN94T4L0015780) was inspected under Respondent Lopez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 633439. The vehicle passed the inspection and Respondent Sanchez issued Certificate of Compliance No. ID828087C.

Second-by-second data shows the emission readings are inconsistent with a legitimate smog check inspection. Bureau Representative Evans identified two or more sharp, simultaneous drops and at least one sharp, simultaneous rise in the concentrations of HC, CO, and/or NO<sub>x</sub>:

- At 44 seconds, during a period of continued steady-state vehicle speed, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop.
- At 55 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to simultaneously rise toward prior levels.
- At 88 seconds, levels of HC, CO, and NO<sub>x</sub> began to drop sharply again.

The same vehicle was tested at Hermanos Test Only just two days prior on April 2, 2019 at 11:32:59 p.m. under Respondent Lopez's Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 633439. This vehicle failed the previous inspection. Second-by-second data shows that levels of NO<sub>x</sub> exceeded the cutpoints during both loaded mode sequences of the ASM test.

35. The data analysis conducted on Hermanos Test Only shows that Respondents participated in a scheme to perform at least 12 fraudulent Smog Check inspections between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, resulting in the issuance of 12 fraudulent electronic Smog Check Certificates of Compliance.

#### 

#### 

# 

## 

## 

#### 

\_ .

#### FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Untrue or Misleading Statements:

#### Automotive Repair Dealer Registration - Respondent Sanchez)

36. Respondent Sanchez's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(1), in that between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, Respondent Sanchez made or authorized statements which she knew or in the exercise of reasonable care should have known to be untrue or misleading, as follows: Respondent Sanchez certified that the vehicles set forth above in Table 1 had passed inspection and were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations. In fact, Respondent Sanchez used the clean gassing method in order to issue smog certificates of compliance, and did not test or inspect the vehicles as required by Health and Safety Code section 44012. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Fraud: Automotive Repair Dealer Registration - Respondent Sanchez)

37. Respondent Sanchez's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(4), in that between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, Respondent Sanchez committed acts which constitute fraud by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for the vehicles set forth above in Table 1 without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

///

///

#### 

# 

## 

## 

## 

## 

#### 

#### 

#### 

## 

### 

## 

## 

#### 

## 

#### THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Material Violation of Automotive Repair Act:

#### **Automotive Repair Dealer Registration - Respondent Sanchez)**

38. Respondent Sanchez's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(6), in that between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, she failed in a material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it when she issued electronic certificates of compliance for the vehicles identified in Table 1 above without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### **FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

#### (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program:

#### **Smog Check Test Only Station License - Respondent Sanchez)**

- 39. Respondent Sanchez's Smog Check Test Only Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Sanchez failed to comply with the following sections of the Health and Safety Code:
- a. **Section 44012:** Respondent Sanchez failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. **Section 44015:** Respondent Sanchez issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles identified in Table 1 above without ensuring that the vehicles were properly tested and inspected to determine if they were in compliance with Health and Safety Code section 44012.
- c. Section 44072.10, subdivision (c)(2) through (c)(4): Respondent Sanchez issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles identified in Table 1 above by

way of tampering with the vehicles' emission control systems or test analyzer systems, causing them to falsely pass the inspection, in intentional and willful violation of this chapter or any regulation, standard, or procedure of the department implementing this chapter.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

## (Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program: Smog Check Test Only Station License - Respondent Sanchez)

- 40. Respondent Sanchez's Smog Check Test Only Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Sanchez failed to comply with the following provisions of California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
- a. **Section 3340.24, subdivision (c):** Respondent Sanchez or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles identified in Table 1 above.
- b. **Section 3340.35, subdivision (c):** Respondent Sanchez issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles identified in Table 1 above, even though the vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42.
- c. **Section 3340.41, subdivision (c):** Respondent Sanchez knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for the vehicles identified in Table 1.
- d. **Section 3340.42:** Respondent Sanchez failed to ensure that the required smog tests were conducted on the vehicles identified in Table 1 above, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.
- e. **Section 3340.45**: Respondent Sanchez failed to perform smog check inspections on the vehicles in Table 1 as prescribed in the operative Smog Check Manual.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

///

## 

### 

## 

## 

## 

## 

### 

## 

## 

### 

## 

## 

## 

## 

#### 

#### 

## 

## 

#### SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit:

#### Smog Check Test Only Station License - Respondent Sanchez)

41. Respondent Sanchez's Smog Check Test Only Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Sanchez committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured, by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program:

#### **Smog Check Inspector License - Respondent Gonzalez)**

42. Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Gonzalez failed to comply with section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code in a material respect, as follows: Respondent Gonzalez failed to perform the emission control tests on those vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### **EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

#### (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program:

#### Smog Check Inspector License - Respondent Gonzalez)

43. Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that between March 21,

2016 and April 4, 2019, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Gonzalez failed to comply with Health and Safety Code section 44072.10, subdivision (c)(2) through (c)(4). Specifically, Respondent Gonzalez issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles identified in Table 1 above, by way of tampering with the vehicles' emission control systems or test analyzer systems, causing them to falsely pass the inspection, in intentional and willful violation of this chapter or any regulation, standard, or procedure of the department implementing this chapter. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### **NINTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

## (Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program: Smog Check Inspector License - Respondent Gonzalez)

- 44. Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, he failed to comply with provisions of California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
- a. **Section 3340.24, subdivision (c):** Respondent Gonzalez falsely or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles identified in Table 1 above.
- b. **Section 3340.30, subdivision (a):** Respondent Gonzalez failed to inspect and test the vehicles identified in Table 1 above, in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035, and California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.
- c. **Section 3340.41, subdivision (c):** Respondent Gonzalez knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for the vehicles identified in Table 1 above.
- d. **Section 3340.42:** Respondent Gonzalez failed to conduct the required smog tests on the vehicles identified in Table 1 above, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

///

e. **Section 3340.45**: Respondent Gonzalez failed to perform smog check inspections on the vehicles in Table 1 as prescribed in the operative Smog Check Manual.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### TENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit:

#### **Smog Check Inspector License - Respondent Gonzalez)**

45. Respondent Gonzalez's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that between March 21, 2016 and April 4, 2019, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Gonzalez committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### **ELEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

#### (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program:

#### **Smog Check Inspector License - Respondent Lopez)**

46. Respondent Lopez's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that on April 4, 2019, regarding vehicle no. 13 as set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Lopez failed to comply with section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code in a material respect, as follows: Respondent Lopez failed to perform the emission control tests on that vehicle in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

///

28 | //

#### TWELFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program:

#### **Smog Check Inspector License - Respondent Lopez)**

47. Respondent Lopez's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that on April 4, 2019, regarding vehicle no. 13 as set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Lopez failed to comply with Health and Safety Code section 44072.10, subdivision (c)(2) through (c)(4). Specifically, Respondent Lopez issued an electronic smog certificate of compliance for the vehicle identified in Table 1 above, by way of tampering with the vehicles' emission control systems or test analyzer systems, causing it to falsely pass the inspection, in intentional and willful violation of this chapter or any regulation, standard, or procedure of the department implementing this chapter. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### THIRTEENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

## (Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program:

#### **Smog Check Inspector License - Respondent Lopez)**

- 48. Respondent Lopez's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), on April 4, 2019, regarding vehicle no. 13 as set forth above in Table 1, he failed to comply with provisions of California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
- a. **Section 3340.24, subdivision (c):** Respondent Lopez falsely or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicle identified in Table 1 above.
- b. **Section 3340.30, subdivision (a):** Respondent Lopez failed to inspect and test the vehicle identified in Table 1 above, in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035, and California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.
- c. **Section 3340.41, subdivision (c):** Respondent Lopez knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for the vehicle identified in Table 1 above.

- d. **Section 3340.42:** Respondent Lopez failed to conduct the required smog tests on the vehicle identified in Table 1 above, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.
- e. **Section 3340.45**: Respondent Lopez failed to perform smog check inspections on the vehicle in Table 1 as prescribed in the operative Smog Check Manual.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### **FOURTEENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit:

#### **Smog Check Inspector License - Respondent Lopez)**

49. Respondent Lopez's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that on April 4, 2019, regarding vehicle no. 13 as set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Lopez committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing an electronic certificate of compliance for that vehicle without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicle, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 32 through 35, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### OTHER MATTERS

- 50. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (c), the Director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by Respondent Sanchez, upon a finding that she has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.
- 51. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check, Test Only, Station License Number TC 267653, issued to Respondent Sanchez, is revoked or suspended following a hearing, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the